



## The cultural dissonance of sustainable live music

Sigrid Røyseng, John Vinge & Heidi Stavrum

**To cite this article:** Sigrid Røyseng, John Vinge & Heidi Stavrum (09 Feb 2024): The cultural dissonance of sustainable live music, Annals of Leisure Research, DOI: [10.1080/11745398.2024.2311900](https://doi.org/10.1080/11745398.2024.2311900)

**To link to this article:** <https://doi.org/10.1080/11745398.2024.2311900>



© 2024 The Author(s). Published by Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group



Published online: 09 Feb 2024.



Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)



Article views: 676



View related articles [↗](#)



View Crossmark data [↗](#)

# The cultural dissonance of sustainable live music

Sigrid Røyseng<sup>a</sup>, John Vinge<sup>a</sup> and Heidi Stavrum<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Department of Music Education and Music Therapy, Norwegian Academy of Music, Oslo, Norway;

<sup>b</sup>Department of Business and IT, University of South-Eastern Norway, Bø, Norway

## ABSTRACT

This article explores the complexities of how environmentally conscious policies and values, often associated with ‘going green’, create cross-pressures for musicians. Successful musicians’ careers have long been associated with values related to international activities and arenas and extensive touring that requires travelling. The article uses the concept of ‘cultural dissonance’ to describe cross-pressures that arise when musicians must navigate these conflicting values in the field of music. Moreover, the article suggests an extension of this concept by considering the structuring principles in the field of music. This expanded framework allows for a more comprehensive analysis of positions and position-takings towards environmentalism. This study is based on qualitative interviews with 57 professional musicians in Norway. In this analysis, three structuring principles were identified: professional roles, centre vs. periphery, and musical generations.

## ARTICLE HISTORY

Received 22 October 2023

Accepted 19 January 2024

## KEYWORDS

Musicians; the field of music; environmentalism; cultural dissonance

## Introduction

Sustainability has become a prominent focus within the music industry. While pop music festival culture has been associated with environmentalism since the 1960s (Brennan et al. 2019), it is fair to claim that environmental values and practices are becoming more pervasive across a wide range of musical genres today. This development involves the performing musicians and the participating audience at live events (Mair and Laing 2012). At these events, various sustainable practices are expected to be in place. For example, drinks are often served in biodegradable glasses; food might be organic, vegetarian, and locally produced; and several attempts might have been made to reduce the total energy consumption of the event. The performing musicians may also be encouraged to travel using eco-friendly methods. Moreover, there have been calls to feature more local musicians in event lineups to reduce the carbon footprint associated with concerts and music festivals.

**CONTACT** Sigrid Røyseng  [sigrid.royseng@nmh.no](mailto:sigrid.royseng@nmh.no)  Department of Music Education and Music Therapy, Norwegian Academy of Music, Oslo, Norway

© 2024 The Author(s). Published by Informa UK Limited, trading as Taylor & Francis Group

This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>), which permits non-commercial re-use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited, and is not altered, transformed, or built upon in any way. The terms on which this article has been published allow the posting of the Accepted Manuscript in a repository by the author(s) or with their consent.

In light of recent research, emerging environmental practices and values in the music industries do not necessarily represent universal values but should instead be understood as cultural practices associated with values that align with specific social positions (Geerts, Vandermoere, and Oosterlynck 2023; Brennan et al. 2019; Jarness and Hansen 2018; Krarup 2022). Accordingly, environmental practices can be seen as encapsulating the cultural and moral distinctions of certain social groups (Brooks and Wilson 2015; Noppers et al. 2014; Laidley 2013; Carfagna et al. 2014). For instance, Geerts, Vandermoere, and Oosterlynck (2023) recently found a strong interconnection between active engagement in cultural consumption and environmental practices, especially among highly educated groups.

While environmental values continue to gain prominence in the music industry, successful musicians' careers have long been associated with values related to international activities and arenas and extensive touring that requires travelling. By applying Bourdieu's concepts (Bourdieu 1993, 1996), one can perceive the music industry as a field where different forms and amounts of capital constitute the prestige and positions of the actors. Thus, environmental practices and values might work as resources for acquiring field-specific capital and be associated with certain positions in the field of music. Thus, the emerging environmental practices in the music industry might represent specific values operating in a field where values and practices related to extensive touring and international activity already represent a well-established form of capital. Subsequently, the emerging environmentalism can be understood in terms of ongoing processes of struggle over what values and practices count as a valid basis for recognition in the field of music. Moreover, musicians might experience cross-pressures stemming from the co-existence of conflicting sets of values and the associated forms of capital.

This paper aims to explore how go green policies and emerging environmental values affect professional musicians' work and the relationship between these experiences and the specific dynamics in the field of music. To this end, we address the following research question: How do emerging environmental values create cross-pressures on the part of musicians, and how are they shaped by struggles and structuring principles in the field of music?

The cross-pressures generated by conflicting values in the field are interpreted as cultural dissonance. The concept of cultural dissonance is developed to capture conflicts between value convictions, on the one hand, and actual behaviours and practices, on the other (Langseth and Vyff 2021). We have previously applied the concept of cultural dissonance related to emerging environmental values in the music industry among Norwegian musicians (Vinge et al. 2022). In this paper, we extend this concept to include structuring principles in the field (Bourdieu 1993, 1996). Consequently, the cultural dissonance of sustainable live music is discussed as interwoven with processes of power. Since emerging environmental practices in the live music industry seem to be markers of the cultural values and moral commitments of certain social groups, this may affect the relationship between different kinds of performers and ultimately between performers and the audience at live music events.

The next section presents the theoretical concepts we apply when analysing how musicians take positions towards environmental values and practices. Subsequently, we discuss the interview study with 57 Norwegian professional musicians and how we analysed the data material for the purposes of this article. After that, we present our analysis

by categorizing it into three distinct dimensions that structure how professional musicians relate to environmental values and practices: professional roles, generations, and geography. Finally, we discuss the implications of the contributions of this article.

## **Leisure, cultural dissonance and the field of music**

Live music events gather large groups of audiences for shorter periods of time.

However, while the time spent together might be brief, the intensity of such events might be strong and have a significant social impact. When applying Stebbins (1992) categorization of leisure, it is reasonable to see live music events such as music festivals and concerts as examples of serious leisure activities (Rossetti and Quinn 2023; Gibson and Connell 2011). Live music events provide arenas where the audience can acquire cultural knowledge, meet people and create a social world where they share a sense of sameness and create a 'unique ethos' (Stebbins 2013, 1992; Rossetti and Quinn 2023). Engaging in events and festivals has in this way been associated with personal development. Several scholars have argued that festival participation can form a basis for acquiring status, skills, knowledge and experience (Rossetti and Quinn 2023; Brown 2007; Robertson and Yeoman 2014).

The acquisition processes associated with live music events not only encompass music related competencies and attitudes, but might involve many aspects of life. O'Rourke, Irwin, and Straker (2011) have, for example, argued that music festivals create opportunities for influencing the environmental practices of their audiences while attending the events. Moreover, they maintain that festivals can instigate change beyond the actual attendance. When live music events are understood in this way, they can also be viewed through a Bourdieusian lens in which the above-mentioned acquisition processes are seen as capital acquisition (Rossetti and Quinn 2023). Calls for live music events to adopt environmental practices can be seen as promoting values specific to particular social positions. Moreover, such values might create experiences of dissonance on the part of musicians since successful careers in the profession long have been associated with practices (e.g. extensive touring and travelling), that in an environmentally conscious light, are now seen as unsustainable.

In music, dissonance refers to discordant sounds that create tension. In the influential psychological theory of cognitive dissonance introduced by Festinger (1962), this term has been used as a powerful metaphor for the underlying tension created when individuals' behaviours are inconsistent with their attitudes and beliefs. As cognitive dissonance is understood as unpleasant, the theory postulates that the underlying tension motivates individuals to change their attitudes or behaviour to produce consistency and consequently cognitive consonance. In environmental psychology, the theory has been used to examine how people resolve inconsistencies between their pro-environmental attitudes and their counter-environmental actions (Lavergne and Pelletier 2015).

In a study of surfers, Langseth and Vyff (2021) have extended the concept of cognitive dissonance to include values in the field in which surfers operate. Their suggestion is that dissonance should not only be understood as an individual and cognitive phenomenon but also as socially constituted. Langseth and Vyff (2021) found that surfers have two conflicting passions. On the one hand, they are environmentally conscious. On the other hand, desires related to travel and surf-related consumption are also prominent.

Langseth and Vyff (2021) suggest that these passions should be understood as shaped by the values of surf culture and consequently also shaped in the process by which surfers seek and receive recognition. More specifically, they suggest that dissonance is shaped by contradicting values in surf culture. In order to capture the social aspect of the experience of dissonance, they have introduced the concept of cultural dissonance. This concept combines Festinger's theory with Bourdieu's concepts of field and capital.

In a recent article, we applied the concept of cultural dissonance to capture some observations among professional musicians in Norway (Vinge et al. 2022). A consistent feature was that many recognized climate change as an urgent problem that could potentially affect the future work situation for musicians. At the same time, the informants believed that making changes in their behaviour that align more closely with climate-related concerns, such as altering their touring practices, might unavoidably lead to adverse effects on their income and career trajectories. In our previous analysis, we identified this cross-pressure in attitudes and behaviour under four main categories: 1) the need for earnings and visibility, 2) the temporal and practical challenges associated with choosing eco-friendly solutions, 3) personal satisfaction and joy in travelling and experiencing the world, and 4) the human and cultural value of international musical work. However, these four trends were not analysed in relation to the informants' different positions in the field of music.

In Bourdieu's sense, a field is a 'separate social universe having its own laws of functioning' (Bourdieu 1993, 162). It is a place of specific struggles concerning questions of knowing who is part of the universe (e.g. who is a real musician and who is not). The struggles revolve around the distribution of field-specific forms of capital. According to Bourdieu, capital should be understood as.

accumulated labor (in its materialized form of its 'incorporated', embodied form), which, when appropriated on a private, i.e. exclusive, basis by agents or groups of agents, enables them to appropriate social energy in the form of reified or living labor. (Bourdieu 2011, 15)

Capital is a resource that enables agents to reproduce or change their position in the field. Fields are structured spaces organized around specific types of capital or combinations of capital. However, actors struggle over the definitions of what should count as capital.

In the field of cultural production, Bourdieu identified two principles of hierarchization (Bourdieu 1993, 1996). The autonomous principle, which can be summed up in the motto 'art for art's sake', means that actors can seek recognition by convincing that their engagement with art is driven purely by artistic interests rather than other ambitions, such as commercial success. The heteronomous principle, on the contrary, is favourable to those who dominate the field economically. Moreover, these two different principles also imply varying target audiences and the nature of the relationships with these audiences. The autonomous principle is associated with a dynamic of production-for-producers in which recognition is sought from peers and other connoisseurs. The heteronomous principle, on the other hand, is associated with demand or popular success within a broader audience. The ongoing struggle between these two principles, as recognized by Bourdieu, should be understood as historically accomplished and, thus, open to change over time.

One of the dynamics shaping the temporal structure and forms of change in fields is related to generations. Accordingly, Bourdieu identified different artistic generations as important in the ongoing struggles in the field of cultural production (Bourdieu 1996, 122f). Bourdieu identified older generations as having a higher degree of consecration since they, over time, had acquired more field-specific capital. Younger generations, on the other hand, were identified as newcomers who had less time to earn field-specific capital and, therefore, a lower degree of consecration. As such, he defined generations more in terms of time spent in the field than the biological age of the actor. Bourdieu maintained that the relationship between the older and the younger generations gave rise to an opposition expressed in terms like outmoded vs. original or well-established vs. avant-garde.

In recent research on environmental awareness, the role of generational differences has been suggested as an important predictor. It is often hypothesized that younger generations are characterized by higher levels of environmental awareness than older generations. A review study showed generally high levels of concern for climate change among younger age groups, but only in some cases higher than in older age groups (Corner et al. 2015). However, such studies are most often based on samples from the general population. There has been comparatively less research into how environmental values influence the dynamics of specific fields. More specifically, exploring how artistic generations in the Bourdieusian sense relate to environmental values is worthwhile.

Johnson and Clisby (2009) have suggested that talking about the environment is an increasingly important arena of struggle for recognition and distinction. They have defined environmental capital as 'social values associated with talking and acting in ways deemed to be environmentalist' (Johnson and Clisby 2009, 173). They also suggest that environmental capital has an increasing influence on other forms of capital. For example, they observe the growing importance of signs of environmentalism for cultural capital. In this way, environmental capital can be seen as a form of capital that can be converted into other forms. Similarly, Jarness and Hansen (2018) found processes of distinction within the Norwegian middle class in the form of boundary drawing between the green 'us' as those involved in environmental protection and 'them' as people with sceptical and negative attitudes towards the environment.

In the Norwegian context, it has been argued that the opposition between the geographical centre and periphery is an additional important dimension in structuring the field of cultural production (Mangset 1998; Røyseng and Stavrum 2020, 2022). Being associated with networks and institutions in the big cities is assumed to give a higher degree of consecration than operating in smaller places in the country's rural districts. Moreover, working in the metropolises of the international artistic scene is assumed to be even more consecrating (Solhjell and Øien 2012).

In sum, professional musicians' ways of relating to environmental values and practices might be based on several principles of hierarchization in the field of music. Such structuring principles might even be important to the degree to which and the ways in which musicians experience cross-pressures regarding environmental issues.

## Data and methods

This article draws on qualitative interview data from a research project that examined the working conditions of professional musicians in Norway (Røyseng, Stavrum, and Vinge

2022). In the project, a broad perspective on musicians' working conditions was included, with a particular focus on how general societal changes affect the field of music and those working there. Hence, in addition to studying artistic values and practices, musical collaborations, and practical considerations of working as musicians, the project delved into how societal issues like changing economic conditions, digitization, gender equality and social diversity, and the Covid-19 pandemic influenced the work situation of musicians. Climate change was one of the themes in the interview guide. However, it was incorporated into the project after some initial interviews, during which younger informants emphasized its importance for understanding and conducting their professional work. In this sense, the environmental issue became part of the project's agenda because it emerged from the field itself.

Semi-structured interviews were conducted with 57 professional musicians in Norway. The sample was intentionally diverse in terms of age, gender, and place of residence, and it encompassed a wide spectrum of musical genres and practices. It is also worth mentioning that while the interview material covers a breadth of the field of music, the most commercial parts are less represented than other parts. The interviews took place from August 2020 to February 2021. Due to the Covid-19 pandemic, many interviews were conducted digitally on Zoom, and they were recorded and subsequently transcribed. The study was conducted in accordance with general guidelines for research ethics in the social sciences and humanities, and the process of collecting and storing the interview data was reported to and approved by SIKT, the Norwegian Agency for Shared Services in Education and Research.

The interview data were analysed through a process of thematic analysis inspired by the 'collective qualitative analysis', as described by Eggebø (2020). This resulted in several topics and themes that were dealt with in separate chapters in a recent book (Røyseng, Stavrum, and Vinge 2022), inclusive of a chapter on the cultural dissonance experienced by professional musicians in relation to the climate crisis. In this article, we develop the analysis by taking into account the principles of hierarchization in the field of music that structure the experience of environmental issues and possibly the cultural dissonance arising from it. In the process of analysing the data for the purposes of this article, we focused on identifying which principles shape the struggles in the field, specifically in relation to environmental issues. This was done by working with the initial coding of the material, where we marked parts of the interviews that revolved around climate crises and change. In the second round of analysis, we ended up with three structuring principles as the most significant.

The analysis presented in the next sections is, thus, organized along three structuring principles. First, we use musicians' different roles in the labour market as a starting point for analysing their positions. This structuring principle emerges from the categorization of musicians into three different professional roles: the project maker, the freelance contributor, and the permanently employed (Stavrum and Røyseng 2022). Many musicians work as self-employed musicians in different musical projects, bands, and ensembles or as composers, conductors, or studio musicians. Among these, we have identified two different professional roles: the project maker and the freelance contributor. While project makers mainly initiate their own musical projects and thereby create work for themselves and others, freelance contributors are musicians who contribute to musical projects initiated by others. In addition, several musicians are permanently employed,



for instance, as orchestra musicians or church musicians. For the purposes of this article, the freelance contributors and the permanently employed musicians are treated as one group since they, to a large extent, are dependent on others in their dealings with environmental issues in their professional work.

Second, we have identified the geographical dimension as important for the way musicians relate to environmental issues. Norway, in relation to its population size, is a vast country with long distances between the northern and southern regions. This has implications for travel opportunities. Moreover, the contrast between the central and peripheral regions has been identified as especially important for understanding national culture and politics (Rokkan, Hagtvet, and Alldén 1987). As we have already introduced, this has also been identified as important to the Norwegian field of cultural production.

Third, we have identified generation as a structuring principle concerning the way musicians take positions towards environmental issues. As already mentioned, the inclusion of environmentalism and climate concerns as a topic in the study was done in response to initial interviews with younger informants. As indicated earlier, artistic generations, as described by Bourdieu (1993, 1996), have been recognized to be crucial to the internal dynamics of the field of cultural production.

In the Bourdieusian tradition, analyses of field structures and dynamics are preferably done by employing multiple correspondence analysis (MCA) on survey data (Savage and Silva 2013). When constructing the three structuring principles of the field, we need to be cautious about the limitations of applying qualitative data. Based on these data, we cannot map the patterns of capital composition and capital distribution in the field of music. Nevertheless, we maintain that the material allows us to identify dimensions that structure the different experiences musicians have in relation to environmental issues and how these are related to processes of consecration.

In the next sections, we present our analysis of how musicians' position-takings towards climate change and environmental issues are shaped by the three identified structuring principles.

## Professional roles and environmentalism in the field of music

We find many examples of statements related to climate commitment and climate concerns that can be interpreted in light of the musicians' professional roles in the field. Among the *freelance contributors* and the *permanently employed*, we come across expressions of the desire to travel in an environmentally friendly manner rather than by aeroplane, an understanding that it is unsustainable to travel across the world for just one concert, advocacy for a locally rooted cultural life, and similar sentiments. At the same time, these informants are in a professional position where they are mainly dependent on other people's choices and decisions in order to survive as musicians and take care of their own careers. An interview passage with a vocalist working as a freelance contributor who does everything from musicals, TV shows, and events brings this aspect to the fore:

I: Younger musicians seem to be concerned about climate change. They are also worried about how they will be able to maintain a climate commitment with their work as musicians. They express a bad conscience about carbon footprints when touring, for example. Have you reflected on that? (...)



D: No (...) The career we have and have chosen is challenging enough in itself, so I can't limit the one thing I do (...) There are many ways to contribute to a better climate, but I won't let it affect my career, no. (Daniela)

Similar attitudes can be found with another vocalist working as a freelance contributor, who, in order to legitimize her own choices, also compares herself to other professional groups:

It's fine that it's being talked about, and that there's awareness of it (...) At the same time, I think that we travel much less compared to other business people. We make up such a small percentage of the large travel sum. I don't think we should have such a bad conscience about traveling and doing concerts. (Vera)

Permanently employed orchestra musicians included in our study also reflect upon climate issues. When asked if she has any thoughts upon her orchestra's green policies, Jane replies, 'Of course', but follows quickly up with, 'But our employer decides for us'. Jane then mentions several policies upon which the musicians agree:

We have, for example, introduced a digital preround in our auditions for new positions. And with that we prevent 80 people traveling unnecessarily for auditions. That is absolutely also an environmental strategy. We are constantly looking for ways (...) Last year we took the train to ... instead of flying. And it is certainly something my colleagues are talking about, how we at all can defend that the orchestra flies to China to play, for example. (Jane)

A project maker, on the other hand, is a musician who establishes her own musical projects, manages her own businesses, and generates work for other musicians. Compared to freelance contributors and those who are permanently employed, we find that project makers have a greater degree of autonomy and are less dependent on the decisions of others, for example, when it comes to adopting more sustainable travelling practices. Instead, we hypothesize that project makers' climate values and practices increase their overall capital, which can be converted into work opportunities and income, especially for project makers with high artistic recognition. Notably, there are several well-known and recognized artists who have received acclaim for their environmentally friendly initiatives, with Coldplay's eco-friendly tour being one prominent example (Mouriquand 2023). Project makers often have more possibilities for income, e.g. commission work, recording projects, royalties, and remuneration, than freelance contributors and, therefore, to a greater extent, can choose to operate more locally.

An Oslo-based musician, band leader, and composer mentions climate challenges several times during the interview. She talks here about sustainability in an extended sense. She thinks touring to the extent she and her colleagues do is problematic:

It's not sustainable, climate-friendly, and things like that, I think, or psychologically because it's very hard to be away from your own everyday life for so long, for me personally. (Lise)

Another project maker reflects a lot about climate change and his own contribution due to his work as a touring musician:

I would say that I'm a kind of climate vandal when it comes to music because I travel and tour a lot. It is undeniably bad for the climate. (Vegard)

Then, he rushes to give examples of everything he does to curb what he labels 'non-sustainable behaviour'. He talks about using the train as the main means of transport to

concerts, and he says he has deliberately settled near the subway with a reasonable public transport distance to most things in the city. He even mentions that he votes for climate-friendly political parties, and so forth, but:

Flying is challenging to defend. I have a bad conscience about it. Air traffic is so polluting. (Vegard)

Nevertheless, as a project maker, he finds ways to compensate for this bad conscience in the way he plans his work:

I have had a very good experience traveling to an airport in Germany, and from there, used trains everywhere, around the whole of Europe, from Germany to the Netherlands to Belgium and things like that, and then flying back home. At least then I have limited much of my carbon footprint instead of flying between places. (...) So I aim to minimize that, but I don't turn down work because of it. If someone wants to give me a concert in New York, I'll say yes since it's dead cool to do it, and the carbon footprint has to be something we work with as a society. (Vegard)

In this way, Vegard works to balance his environmental convictions and career opportunities related to international touring. This last quotation also indicates that the geographical dimension matters to the experience of environmental issues. An invitation to play in New York trumps the informant's environmental concerns.

### **Centre vs. periphery and environmentalism in the field of music**

Although the artistic population in Norway, in general, lives in more centralized places than the general population (Heian, Løyland, and Kleppe 2015; Mangset 1998), there are, due to a comprehensive cultural policy, musicians working and living in the whole country. Nevertheless, geographical distances play a role in how the informants relate to the idea of a potentially more sustainable musicianship. Reflecting on why she is based in Oslo, one informant mentions all the concert venues, art institutions, and musical collaborators that also live in Oslo, alongside touring:

I don't want to travel that much. And you don't have equivalences like the National Scene for Dance, Victoria National Jazz Scene, Hæverket [venue for alternative music] and Oslo Concert Hall in the same area anywhere else in Norway. (Lise)

Conversely, musicians located in the rural districts of the country point to climate-conscious musicians who reside in more central areas with well-developed public transport as examples of people who are out of touch with the realities faced in other parts of the country. This can be interpreted as a form of boundary-drawing related to the centre vs. periphery dimension, which is most notably represented by the contrast between the capital city, Oslo, and the rest of the country. This is addressed by a musician who has settled down in the northern part of Norway.

It is clear that we are in a tight spot in relation to the climate. If no one is going to fly anymore, then we don't exist. Then everyone has to live in Oslo (...) It may very well be the future, that it's actually not possible for a band like us to exist here, that it doesn't have the right to life in a way (...) we can for example, not drive around on tour with studded tires. There are quite a few 'Oslo things' that don't work at all up here. You cannot tour by train, for example, because there are no trains.

Another says similarly:

After all, we travel by plane, we have enormous distances (...) You don't drive from Trondheim to Finnmark, for example, you don't. But you can do that (...) but then I think I would have had to replace my musicians, because they would never have agreed to that. (Heidi)

As mentioned, the centre–periphery dimension in the field of music concerns more than being located in a specific place. It is also about artistic recognition, where some arenas in certain cities are more prestigious to perform than others, and some ways of living as a musician are more valued than others. In classical music, especially when being a soloist at a certain level, it is expected that you should be touring extensively, playing with famous orchestras and conductors in spectacular concert venues all over the world. Furthermore, some classical orchestras and ensembles with good artistic reputations are organized as projects, where musicians from different parts of a country or even several different countries travel long distances to rehearse and play concerts together, as this musician describes:

A couple of years ago, I was touring with [name of international chamber orchestra]. Of course, this is an orchestra which is based on being in different places all the time. So, all the musicians go somewhere to rehearse for a few days, and then they go touring. That is the concept of the orchestra. (Sophia)

Until now, this has been the accepted way of organizing things in the field of classical music. However, according to this musician, and other classical informants of this study, things are starting to change. Or, at least, it is being discussed whether this is a eco-friendly way of organizing the activity:

They started to talk about it, especially the Swedish members, because it was a lot about this in Sweden at that time. Of course, one must consider why people should travel all over the world and buy a lot of plane tickets and play exactly the same music as local musicians can do themselves. (Sophia)

Here, our informant refers to the fact that many orchestras play the same canonical repertoire of classical music wherever they are located in the world. She is aware that in that sense it might seem irrational with all the travels, and that one should balance the activity and 'not go touring just to go touring'. On the other hand, she continues to argue that it is also necessary, for the sake of the art, to sometimes go abroad or to the other side of the world:

But of course, it is also in itself important, for art itself, exactly this, to hear different people play the same music. This also says something about art itself. And for those performing the music is good to have this opportunity. (Sophia)

In her last quote, this musician clearly leans on Bourdieu's autonomous principle of hierarchization. For her, the value of the music itself is of greater concern than the concern for the climate crisis.

In our sample of musicians, we also find several informants who have made deliberate choices to establish a life and a career in places outside of the bigger cities of Norway. These musicians might distance themselves from the strong valuation of the centre of the field of music. One of the project makers, who is also a classical musician, has

chosen to dismiss the international touring lifestyle in favour of establishing a new life in a smaller city in a remote part of Norway. She has moved there with her husband and children and created a career locally that, according to her, fulfils both artistic and personal needs:

This was not at all what I had expected when I finished my musical education. Then I thought I had to become a soloist and tour internationally with orchestras and that kind of life. I did too, for a couple of years, but then I had nothing left. I was done. I had to rethink a bit. Then we got this opportunity. We just had a baby. In my period of leave I felt that something had to happen. We moved and I re-established here. (Zoey)

Zoey and her family are now well integrated into the small town and the local music community, where she has initiated several classical projects and happenings, both in collaboration with other professional musicians as well as amateurs:

Well, I am not allowed to perform on the biggest stages and do the most prestigious projects with the most prestigious conductors. But I have things to do all the time. I do concerts almost every week. (Zoey)

For her, moving into the periphery and distancing herself from what is expected of her as a classically trained soloist has made her career more sustainable in other senses, when she can be present at home with her family and do projects locally (Oakley and Ward 2018).

## **Musical generations and environmentalism in the field of music**

As already mentioned, the topic of environmentalism was introduced into this study by some of the younger informants in the initial interviews. When asked about her thoughts on how the music profession will evolve in the years ahead, one relatively young but already quite recognized musician answers:

I think the big question will be climate change. (...) But it depends somewhat on the big institutions and the big academies of music. If they will be involved in it, and if they are gutsy enough to talk about climate challenge and meet the challenges head-on. (Elena)

Another younger musician explains that climate considerations are decisive for the choices she makes in several aspects of her life, including how she chooses to travel to gigs:

That's why I make such active choices both as a musician and as a person in general, by not eating so much meat and trying to take as few flights as possible. (Cora)

At the same time, established musicians can be more selective in the jobs they accept, knowing that they have good alternatives for making an income locally and nationally as well. For example, a musician who resides in a smaller place, a considerable distance from the nearest airport, has recently curtailed her fairly extensive touring activity abroad. Interestingly, this decision has not significantly affected her income. At the same time, her story testifies to a possible devaluation of the status linked to extensive travelling:

It is clear that when you travel as much by plane as I did for many years, it is completely out [...]. Yes, the gold card was an honour. Now, it is perhaps a bit embarrassing to have a gold card on SAS. (Britt)

However, an informant from the older generation of musicians comes with some advice to the younger generation during the interview, stating that they have to give up a number of things if they are to act 'politically' correctly. It emerges from the interview that he is happy that he is not in that age group himself, given the circumstances:

It is also a question today how many of the young people, say those in their 24-30s, are going to front their politics so much. Then they must know that they lose quite a lot from that too. And if they are going to front that policy, then they have to stand for it all the way. I am very happy that I ... *(pauses, and then he changes his mind)* ... I also work for the climate within my field with climate-neutral travel and all that. But it is important that if you go into this, you also have to give up quite a few things. It's just the way it is. You might get a little less money and a little less to live for. (Nathan)

When asked if he is concerned about the climate when he plans concerts and tours, he replies:

You can think about everything, of course. But again, it will be a choice you make and it will also have financial consequences that you need to know about. If it doesn't mean that much to you (losing financial income), then you can choose ways to conduct your business as it suits you. If you want to travel around, be a militant feminist and vegan, and use every time someone eats meat to comment on it ... It's not that much fun to travel around on tour with those kind of musicians, where that is the main topic of every conversation every time you have lunch and dinner. I'm happy myself not to eat meat in every meal, but I am not militant. (Nathan)

In this way, the informant draws a boundary between being environmentally conscious and being politically militant. In our material, we find this to be a boundary that is constructed between the older and younger generations. While the younger generation is eager to talk about climate issues even without being asked about it, the older generation answers when asked about it, but it is not something they identify to be at the core of discussions of what it means to be a musician today.

## Concluding discussion

This article builds upon the concept of cultural dissonance as originally introduced by Langseth and Vyff (2021). In line with the original concept, we have observed that when musicians take positions towards environmental issues, many of them experience a sense of dissonance. On the one hand, they express environmental values and engage in discussions about environmentally responsible practices associated with their professional work and personal lives. On the other hand, they also factor in considerations related to other aspects of their careers, such as seizing opportunities for cool gigs requiring extensive travelling. This can be understood as the result of contradictory values being present in the field simultaneously. However, this article suggests that the experience of cultural dissonance is additionally shaped by the ongoing struggles and structuring principles in the field. Musicians' position-takings towards environmental values and practices can be understood in relation to their positions in the field. In our analysis, three structuring principles were identified: professional roles, centre vs. periphery, and musical generations.

Musicians working in the professional role of project makers are more in the position to choose and signal their values and practices related to environmental issues than

freelance contributors and those who are permanently employed. However, dissonant feelings were articulated by individuals in all these roles. For project makers, the dissonance was mainly related to the divergent considerations of their environmental values and career opportunities. The cultural dissonance experienced by freelance contributors and those who were permanently employed was more related to the cross-pressures arising from their environmental convictions and the limited opportunities they had to align their lifestyles and choices with those convictions.

Geography also plays a significant role in shaping the experience of cultural dissonance in the field of music. Musicians who are located in or near the central hub of the musical scene, often situated in the capital city, have a distinct advantage in taking a clear stance towards environmental issues because they can perform at renowned music venues without the need for extensive travel. In this way, living and working in the centre thus offers a twofold opportunity for capital acquisition: by building artistic capital at prestigious venues and by building environmental capital by signalling an eco-friendly work and lifestyle. For musicians based in the periphery, the dissonance is perhaps stronger because they often feel that they have no option but to engage in extensive travel, even if they hold strong environmental convictions.

The interplay between younger and older generations introduces a more nuanced dynamic in shaping the cultural dissonance of musicians. While we observe a concern for climate issues among musicians regardless of their years in the field, we also find some differences. On the one hand, environmental issues seem to be more urgent to representatives of the younger than to the older generation. On the other hand, since older generations of musicians have stayed for a longer time in the field, they have also built more capital and established more income possibilities. Younger generations have had less time to accumulate field-specific capital and, therefore, may feel less liberated to prioritize their environmental convictions over career prospects.

The findings presented in this article, along with the expanded concept of cultural dissonance have implications for ongoing discussions in cultural sociology. Bourdieu's field analysis has been criticized for assuming that different logics of consecration belong to different parts of the field of cultural production. Critics argue that these logics co-exist at the same time and in the same part of the field (Beljean, Chong, and Lamont 2015; Molnár 2018). Swidler (2001) has even proposed that people are more pragmatic than Bourdieu's field analysis assumes. She suggests that people use different cultural repertoires to make sense of different situations without being concerned about being inconsistent. Cultural dissonance can be seen as a way of conceptualizing the co-existence of different principles of hierarchization. As such, it is a response to the call for ways to capture how such principles can be entangled. However, both the concept and our data indicate that people experience distress when their beliefs and actions are in contradiction.

The concept of cultural dissonance in the field of music may also have implications for audiences, and hence also for people experiencing other leisure activities and practices than what is addressed here. As Bourdieu suggested, different hierarchization principles extend to the various types and roles of audiences. Our analysis indicates that environmentalism is becoming an increasingly important capital form in the field of music. It is reasonable to assume that this not only applies to musicians but also to music leisure activities. However, further research is needed to gain deeper insight into this matter.

## Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author(s).

## References

- Beljean, Stefan, Phillipa Chong, and Michèle Lamont. 2015. "A Post-Bourdieuian Sociology of Valuation and Evaluation for the Field of Cultural Production." In *Routledge International Handbook of the Sociology of Art and Culture*, edited by Laurie Hanquinet and Mike Savage. London: Routledge.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1993. *The Field of Cultural Production: Essays on art and Literature*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1996. *The Rules of art: Genesis and Structure of the Literary Field, Les règles de l'art*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 2011. "The Forms of Capital." In *Cultural theory: An Anthology*, edited by Imre Szeman and Timothy Kaposy, 81–93. Malden, Mass.: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Brennan, Matt, Jo Collinson Scott, Angela Connolly, and Gemma Lawrence. 2019. "Do Music Festival Communities Address Environmental Sustainability and how? A Scottish Case Study." *Popular Music* 38 (2): 252–275. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0261143019000035>
- Brooks, Jeremy S, and Charlie Wilson. 2015. "The Influence of Contextual Cues on the Perceived Status of Consumption-Reducing Behavior." *Ecological Economics* 117: 108–117. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolecon.2015.06.015>
- Brown, Carroll A. 2007. "The Carolina Shaggers: Dance as Serious Leisure." *Journal of Leisure Research* 39 (4): 623–647. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00222216.2007.11950125>.
- Carfagna, Lindsey B, Emilie A Dubois, Connor Fitzmaurice, Monique Y Ouimette, Juliet B Schor, Margaret Willis, and Thomas Laidley. 2014. "An Emerging eco-Habitus: The Reconfiguration of High Cultural Capital Practices among Ethical Consumers." *Journal of Consumer Culture* 14 (2): 158–178. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1469540514526227>
- Corner, Adam, Olga Roberts, Sybille Chiari, Sonja Völler, Elisabeth S. Mayrhuber, Sylvia Mandl, and Kate Monson. 2015. "How do Young People Engage with Climate Change? The Role of Knowledge, Values, Message Framing, and Trusted Communicators." *WIREs Climate Change* 6 (5): 523–534. <https://doi.org/10.1002/wcc.353>
- Eggebo, Helga. 2020. "Kollektiv kvalitativ Analyse." *Norsk Sosiologisk Tidsskrift* 4 (2): 106–122. <https://doi.org/10.18261/issn.2535-2512-2020-02-03>
- Festinger, Leon. 1962. *A Theory of Cognitive Dissonance*. Reissue. ed. Stanford, Calif: Stanford University Press.
- Geerts, Robbe, Frédéric Vandermoere, and Stijn Oosterlynck. 2023. "Culture and Green Tastes. A Sociological Analysis of the Relationship Between Cultural Engagement and Environmental Practices." *Poetics* 97: 101768. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.poetic.2023.101768>
- Gibson, Chris, and John Connell. 2011. "Culturing Commitment: Serious Leisure and the Folk Festival Experience." In *Festival places: revitalising rural Australia*, edited by Chris Gibson and John Connell. United Kingdom: Channel View Publications, Limited.
- Heian, Mari Torvik, Knut Løyland, and Bård Kleppe. 2015. *Kunstnerundersøkelsen 2013*. Kunstneres inntekter. Bø: Telemarksforskning
- Jarness, Vegard, and Maud Lauvstad Hansen. 2018. "Grønne grenser." *Norsk sosiologisk tidsskrift* 2 (3): 208–224. <https://doi.org/10.18261/issn.2535-2512-2018-03-02>
- Johnson, Mark, and Suzanne Clisby. 2009. "Naturalising Distinctions: The Contested Field of Environmental Relations in Costa Rica." *Landscape Research* 34 (2): 171–187. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01426390802390517>
- Krupar, Troels. 2022. "The Politics of the Urban Green: Class, Morality and Attachments to Place." *The Sociological Review* 70 (6): 1119–1140. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00380261221083792>
- Laidley, Thomas. 2013. "Climate, Class and Culture: Political Issues as Cultural Signifiers in the US." *The Sociological Review* 61 (1): 153–171. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-954X.12008>
- Langseth, Tommy, and Adam Vyff. 2021. "Cultural Dissonance: Surfers' Environmental Attitudes and Actions." *Frontiers in Sports and Active Living* 3 (252).



- Lavergne, Karine J, and Luc G Pelletier. 2015. "Predicting Individual Differences in the Choice of Strategy to Compensate for Attitude-Behaviour Inconsistencies in the Environmental Domain." *Journal of Environmental Psychology* 44: 135–148. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvp.2015.10.001>
- Mair, Judith, and Jennifer Laing. 2012. "The Greening of Music Festivals: Motivations, Barriers and Outcomes." *Applying the Mair and Jago Model.* *Journal of Sustainable Tourism* 20 (5): 683–700.
- Mangset, Per. 1998. "The Artist in Metropolis: Centralisation Processes and Decentralisation in the Artistic Field." *International Journal of Cultural Policy* 5 (1): 49–74. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10286639809358089>
- Molnár, Virág. 2018. "The Business of Urban Coolness: Emerging Markets for Street art." *Poetics (Amsterdam)* 71: 43–54. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.poetic.2018.09.006>
- Mouriquand, David. 2023. "Fix You: Coldplay's eco-Friendly Tour Reduces Band's Carbon Emissions by Nearly Half." In *Euronews Culture*. <https://www.euronews.com/culture/2023/06/05/fix-you-coldplays-eco-friendly-tour-reduces-bands-carbon-emissions-by-nearly-half>.
- Noppers, Ernst H, Kees Keizer, Jan Willem Bolderdijk, and Linda Steg. 2014. "The Adoption of Sustainable Innovations: Driven by Symbolic and Environmental Motives." *Global Environmental Change* 25: 52–62. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2014.01.012>
- Oakley, Kate, and Jonathan Ward. 2018. "The art of the Good Life: Culture and Sustainable Prosperity." *Cultural Trends* 27 (1): 4–17. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09548963.2018.1415408>.
- O'Rourke, Stephanie, David Irwin, and Jo Straker. 2011. "Dancing to Sustainable Tunes: An Exploration of Music Festivals and Sustainable Practices in Aotearoa." *Annals of Leisure Research* 14 (4): 341–354. <https://doi.org/10.1080/11745398.2011.639383>.
- Robertson, Martin, and Ian Yeoman. 2014. "Signals and Signposts of the Future: Literary Festival Consumption in 2050." *Tourism Recreation Research* 39 (3): 321–342. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02508281.2014.11087004>.
- Rokkan, Stein, Bernt Hagtvet, and Lars Alldén. 1987. *Stat, nasjon, klasse : essays i politisk sosiologi, Det Blå bibliotek*. Oslo: Universitetsforl.
- Rossetti, Giulia, and Bernadette Quinn. 2023. "The Value of the Serious Leisure Perspective in Understanding Cultural Capital Embodiment in Festival Settings." *The Sociological Review* 71 (3): 526–543. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00380261221108589>
- Røyseng, Sigrid, and Heidi Stavrum. 2020. "Fields of Gold: Reflections on the Research Relations of the Cultural Policy Researcher." *International Journal of Cultural Policy* 26 (5): 697–708. <http://doi.org/10.1080/10286632.2019.1643335>.
- Røyseng, Sigrid, and Heidi Stavrum. 2022. "Synlighet som karriereressurs for musikere." In *Musikerne, bransjen og samfunnet*, edited by Sigrid Røyseng, Heidi Stavrum, and John Vinge. Oslo: Cappelen Damm Akademisk.
- Røyseng, Sigrid, Heidi Stavrum, and John Vinge. 2022. *Musikerne, bransjen og samfunnet*. Oslo: Cappelen Damm Akademisk.
- Savage, Mike, and Elizabeth B. Silva. 2013. "Field Analysis in Cultural Sociology." *Cultural Sociology* 7 (2): 111–126. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1749975512473992>
- Solhjell, Dag, and Jon Øien. 2012. *Det norske kunstfeltet : en sosiologisk innføring*. Oslo: Universitetsforl.
- Stavrum, Heidi, and Sigrid Røyseng. 2022. "Musikerroller og grensedragninger i musikkarbeidsmarkedet." In *Musikerne, bransjen og samfunnet*, edited by Sigrid Røyseng, Heidi Stavrum, and John Vinge, 23–48. Oslo: Cappelen Damm akademisk.
- Stebbins, Robert A. 1992. *Amateurs, Professionals and Serious Leisure*. Montreal, Buffalo: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Stebbins, Robert A. 2013. *The Committed Reader: Reading for Utility, Pleasure, and Fulfillment in the Twenty-First Century*. Lanham: Scarecrow Press, Inc.
- Swidler, Ann. 2001. "What Anchors Cultural Practices." In *The Practice Turn in Contemporary Theory*, edited by Theodore R. Schatzki, Karin Knorr Cetina, and Eike von Savigny, 83–101. New York: Routledge.
- Vinge, John, Sigrid Røyseng, Guro Utne Salvesen, and Simen Skrebergene. 2022. "Musikerne og klimakrisen." In *Musikerne, bransjen og samfunnet*, edited by Sigrid Røyseng, Heidi Stavrum, and John Vinge, 247–265. Oslo: Cappelen Damm Akademisk.